

University of Wollongong  
**Research Online**

---

Faculty of Informatics - Papers (Archive)

Faculty of Engineering and Information  
Sciences

---

2012

**Combining outputs from the North American Regional Climate Change  
Assessment Program by using a Bayesian hierarchical model**

Emily L. Kang  
*University of Cincinnati*

Noel Cressie  
*University of Wollongong, [ncressie@uow.edu.au](mailto:ncressie@uow.edu.au)*

Stephan R. Sain  
*National Center For Atmospheric Research, Boulder, United States*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/infopapers>



Part of the [Physical Sciences and Mathematics Commons](#)

---

**Recommended Citation**

Kang, Emily L.; Cressie, Noel; and Sain, Stephan R.: Combining outputs from the North American Regional Climate Change Assessment Program by using a Bayesian hierarchical model 2012, 291-313.  
<https://ro.uow.edu.au/infopapers/2262>

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: [research-pubs@uow.edu.au](mailto:research-pubs@uow.edu.au)

---

# Combining outputs from the North American Regional Climate Change Assessment Program by using a Bayesian hierarchical model

## Abstract

We investigate the 20-year-average boreal winter temperatures generated by an ensemble of six regional climate models (RCMs) in phase I of the North American Regional Climate Change Assessment Program. We use the long-run average (20-year integration) to smooth out variability and to capture the climate properties from the RCM outputs. We find that, although the RCMs capture the large-scale climate variation from coast to coast and from south to north similarly, their outputs can differ substantially in some regions. We propose a Bayesian hierarchical model to synthesize information from the ensemble of RCMs, and we construct a consensus climate signal with each RCM contributing to the consensus according to its own variability parameter. The Bayesian methodology enables us to make posterior inference on all the unknowns, including the large-scale fixed effects and the small-scale random effects in the consensus climate signal and in each RCM. The joint distributions of the consensus climate and the outputs from the RCMs are also investigated through posterior means, posterior variances and posterior spatial quantiles. We use a spatial random-effects model in the Bayesian hierarchical model and, consequently, we can deal with the large data sets of fine resolution outputs from all the RCMs. Additionally, our model allows a flexible spatial covariance structure without assuming stationarity or isotropy.

## Keywords

climate, change, assessment, program, regional, bayesian, combining, hierarchical, outputs, model, american, north

## Disciplines

Physical Sciences and Mathematics

## Publication Details

Kang, E. L., Cressie, N. & Sain, S. R. (2012). Combining outputs from the North American Regional Climate Change Assessment Program by using a Bayesian hierarchical model. *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society. Series C: Applied Statistics*, 61 (2), 291-313.

Hub

ScienceDirect

Scopus

Applications

SciVerse - Elsevier's product suite for search and discovery

Register

Login

Go to SciVal Suite

UNIVERSITY OF  
WOLLONGONG

Search

Sources

Analytics

Alerts

My list

Settings

Live Chat

Help

Tutorials

Quick Search

Search

1 of 1

FIND @ UOW

Download

Export

Print

E-mail

Create bibliography

Add to My List

[Journal of the Royal Statistical Society. Series C: Applied Statistics](#)

Volume 61, Issue 2, March 2012, Pages 291-313

## Combining outputs from the North American Regional Climate Change Assessment Program by using a Bayesian hierarchical model

[Kang, E.L.<sup>a</sup>](#), [Cressie, N.<sup>b</sup>](#), [Sain, S.R.<sup>c</sup>](#)<sup>a</sup> University of Cincinnati, United States<sup>b</sup> Ohio State University, Columbus, United States<sup>c</sup> National Center for Atmospheric Research, Boulder, United States

### Abstract

We investigate the 20-year-average boreal winter temperatures generated by an ensemble of six regional climate models (RCMs) in phase I of the North American Regional Climate Change Assessment Program. We use the long-run average (20-year integration) to smooth out variability and to capture the climate properties from the RCM outputs. We find that, although the RCMs capture the large-scale climate variation from coast to coast and from south to north similarly, their outputs can differ substantially in some regions. We propose a Bayesian hierarchical model to synthesize information from the ensemble of RCMs, and we construct a consensus climate signal with each RCM contributing to the consensus according to its own variability parameter. The Bayesian methodology enables us to make posterior inference on all the unknowns, including the large-scale fixed effects and the small-scale random effects in the consensus climate signal and in each RCM. The joint distributions of the consensus climate and the outputs from the

[View references \(44\)](#)

### Cited by since 1996

This article has been cited **0** times in Scopus.

Inform me when this document is cited in Scopus:

[Set alert](#)[Set feed](#)

### Related documents

Showing the 2 most relevant related documents by all shared references:

[Kang, E.L.](#), [Cressie, N.](#)**Bayesian inference for the spatial random effects model**(2011) *Journal of the American Statistical Association*[Cressie, N.](#), [Assunção, R.](#), [Holan, S.H.](#)**Dynamical random-set modeling of concentrated precipitation in North America**(2012) *Statistics and its Interface*[View all related documents](#) based on all shared references or [select the shared references](#) to use

RCMs are also investigated through posterior means, posterior variances and posterior spatial quantiles. We use a spatial random-effects model in the Bayesian hierarchical model and, consequently, we can deal with the large data sets of fine resolution outputs from all the RCMs. Additionally, our model allows a flexible spatial covariance structure without assuming stationarity or isotropy. © 2011 Royal Statistical Society.

## Author keywords

Downscaling; North American Regional Climate Change Assessment Program; Posterior distribution; Regional climate model; Spatial random-effects model

ISSN: 00359254 Source Type: Journal Original language: English

DOI: [10.1111/j.1467-9876.2011.01010.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9876.2011.01010.x) Document Type: Article

## References (44)

[View in table layout](#)

☐ Page ☐ Export ☐ Print ☐ E-mail ☐ Create bibliography

☐ Baladandayuthapani, V., Mallick, B.K., Young Hong, M., Lupton, J.R., Turner, N.D., Carroll, R.J.

1 [Bayesian hierarchical spatially correlated functional data analysis with application to colon carcinogenesis](#)

(2008) *Biometrics*, 64 (1), pp. 64-73. [Cited 25 times](#).

doi: [10.1111/j.1541-0420.2007.00846.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1541-0420.2007.00846.x)



☐ Banerjee, S., Carlin, B., Gelfand, A.E.

2 (2004) *Hierarchical Modeling and Analysis for Spatial Data*. [Cited 551 times](#).

Boca Raton: Chapman and Hall



☐ Banerjee, S., Gelfand, A.E., Finley, A.O., Sang, H.

3 [Gaussian predictive process models for large spatial data sets](#)

(2008) *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society. Series B: Statistical Methodology*, 70 (4), pp.

Find more related documents in Scopus based on:

[Authors](#) | [Keywords](#)



### More By These Authors

The authors of this article have a total of **204 records** in Scopus:  
(Showing 5 most recent)

[Cressie, N., Wang, R.](#)

[Statistical properties of the state obtained by solving a nonlinear multivariate inverse problem](#)

(2012) *Applied Stochastic Models in Business and Industry*

[Mearns, L.O., Arritt, R., Biner, S., Bukovsky, M.S., McGinnis, S., Sain, S., Caya, D., Correia Jr., J., Flory, D., Gutowski, W., Takle, E.S., Jones, R., Leung, R., Moufouma-Okia, W., McDaniel, L., Nunes, A.M.B., Qian, Y., Roads, J., Sloan, L., Snyder, M.](#)

[Add apps](#) | [Help](#)

825-848. Cited 71 times.

doi: [10.1111/j.1467-9868.2008.00663.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9868.2008.00663.x)



☐ Berliner, V.M., Kim, Y.

4 **Bayesian design and analysis for superensemble-based climate forecasting**

(2008) *Journal of Climate*, 21 (9), pp. 1891-1910. Cited 13 times.

<http://ams.allenpress.com/archive/1520-0442/21/9/pdf/i1520-0442-21-9-1891.pdf>

doi: [10.1175/2007JCLI1619.1](https://doi.org/10.1175/2007JCLI1619.1)



☐ Berliner, L.M., Wike, C.K., Cressie, N.

5 **Long-lead prediction of Pacific SSTs via Bayesian dynamic modeling**

(2000) *Journal of Climate*, 13 (22), pp. 3953-3968. Cited 64 times.



☐ Buser, C.M., Künsch, H.R., Weber, A.

6 **Biases and Uncertainty in Climate Projections**

(2010) *Scandinavian Journal of Statistics*, 37 (2), pp. 179-199. Cited 4 times.

doi: [10.1111/j.1467-9469.2009.00686.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9469.2009.00686.x)



☐ Christensen, W.F., Sain, S.R.

7 **Latent Variable Modeling for Integrating Output from Multiple Climate Models**

(2012) *Mathematical Geosciences*, 44 (4), pp. 395-410.

doi: [10.1007/s11004-011-9321-1](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11004-011-9321-1)



☐ Cressie, N., Johannesson, G.

8 **Spatial prediction of massive datasets**

(2006) *Proc. Australian Academy of Science Elizabeth and Frederick White Conf.*, pp. 1-11. Cited 5 times.

Canberra: Australian Academy of Science.

[FIND@UOW](#)

- ☐ Cressie, N., Johannesson, G.

9 **Fixed rank kriging for very large spatial data sets**

(2008) *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society. Series B: Statistical Methodology*, 70 (1), pp.

209-226. [Cited 64 times](#).

doi: [10.1111/j.1467-9868.2007.00633.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9868.2007.00633.x)

[FIND@UOW](#)

- ☐ Cressie, N., Kang, E.

10 **High-resolution digital soil mapping: Kriging for very large datasets**

(2010) *Proximal Soil Sensing*, pp. 49-63. [Cited 7 times](#).

(eds R. Viscarra-Rossel, A. B. McBratney and B. Minasny). Dordrecht: Springer.

[FIND@UOW](#)

- ☐ DuMouchel, W.

11 **Bayesian meta-analysis**

(1990) *Statistical Methods for Pharmacology*, pp. 509-529. [Cited 59 times](#).

(ed. D. A. Berry). New York: Dekker.

[FIND@UOW](#)

- ☐ Fennessy, M.J., Shukla, J.

12 **Seasonal prediction over North America with a regional model nested in a global model**

(2000) *Journal of Climate*, 13 (14), pp. 2605-2627. [Cited 43 times](#).

[FIND@UOW](#)

- ☐ Furrer, R., Sain, S.R., Nychka, D., Meehl, G.A.

13 **Multivariate Bayesian analysis of atmosphere-ocean general circulation models**

(2007) *Environmental and Ecological Statistics*, 14 (3), pp. 249-266. [Cited 37 times](#).

doi: [10.1007/s10651-007-0018-z](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10651-007-0018-z)



- ☐ Gilks, W., Richardson, S., Spiegelhalter, D.  
14 (1996) *Markov Chain Monte Carlo in Practice*. Cited 3197 times.  
(eds). London: Chapman and Hall.



- ☐ Kanamitsu, M., Ebisuzaki, W., Woollen, J., Yang, S.-K., Hnilo, J.J., Fiorino, M., Potter, G.L.  
15 **NCEP-DOE AMIP-II reanalysis (R-2)**  
(2002) *Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society*, 83 (11), pp. 1631-1643+1559. Cited 1338 times.



- ☐ Kang, E.L., Cressie, N.  
16 **Bayesian inference for the spatial random effects model**  
(2011) *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 106 (495), pp. 972-983. Cited 3 times.  
<http://pubs.amstat.org/doi/pdf/10.1198/jasa.2011.tm09680>  
doi: 10.1198/jasa.2011.tm09680



- ☐ Kang, E.L., Noel, C., Tao, S.  
17 **Using temporal variability to improve spatial mapping with application to satellite data**  
(2010) *Canadian Journal of Statistics*, 38 (2), pp. 271-289. Cited 7 times.  
<http://www3.interscience.wiley.com/cgi-bin/fulltext/123461074/PDFSTART>  
doi: 10.1002/cjs.10063



- ☐ Kaufman, C.G., Sainy, S.R.  
18 **Bayesian functional ANOVA modeling using Gaussian process prior distributions**  
(2010) *Bayesian Analysis*, 5 (1), pp. 123-150. Cited 14 times.  
<http://ba.stat.cmu.edu/journal/2010/vol05/issue01/kaufman.pdf>  
doi: 10.1214/10-BA505



- ☐ Lahiri, S.N., Kaiser, M.S., Cressie, N., Hsu, N.-J.

19 **Prediction of Spatial Cumulative Distribution Functions Using Subsampling**

(1999) *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 94 (445), pp. 86-97. Cited 44 times.

FIND@UOW 

- ☐ Lopes, H.F., Salazar, E., Gamerman, D.

20 **Spatial dynamic factor analysis**

(2008) *Bayesian Analysis*, 3 (4), pp. 759-792. Cited 19 times.

<http://ba.stat.cmu.edu/journal/2008/vol03/issue04/lopes.pdf>

doi: 10.1214/08-BA329

FIND@UOW 

- ☐ Massam, H.

21 **Prior distributions for covariance/precision matrices, part 1**

(2009) *Int. Soc. Baysn Anal. Bull.*, 16, pp. 8-11. Cited 2 times.

FIND@UOW 

- ☐ Massam, H.

22 **Prior distributions for covariance/precision matrices, part 2**

(2010) *Int. Soc. Baysn Anal. Bull.*, 17, pp. 5-7.

FIND@UOW 

- ☐ McAvaney, B., Covey, C., Joussaume, S., Kattsov, V., Kitoh, A., Ogana, W., Pitman, A., (...), Zhao, Z.

23

**Model evaluation**

(2001) *Climate Change 2001: the Scientific Basis*, pp. 471-524. Cited 122 times.

(ed. J. T. Houghton). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

FIND@UOW 

- ☐ Mearns, L., Arritt, R., Biner, S., Bukovsky, M., McGinnis, S., Sain, S., Caya, D., (...), Snyder, M.

24



## The North American Regional Climate Change Assessment program: overview of Phase I results

(2010) *Bull. Am. Meteorol. Soc*

Submitted to

[FIND@UOW](#)

### ☐ [A regional climate change assessment program for North America](#)

25 (2009) *Eos*, 90 (36), p. 311. [Cited 56 times](#).

doi: [10.1029/2009EO360002](https://doi.org/10.1029/2009EO360002)

[FIND@UOW](#)

### ☐ Meehl, G., Boer, G., Covey, C., Latif, M., Stouffer, R.

### 26 **The coupled model intercomparison project (CMIP)**

(2000) *Bull. Am. Meteorol. Soc.*, 81, pp. 313-318. [Cited 160 times](#).

[FIND@UOW](#)

### ☐ Reilly, J., Stone, P.H., Forest, C.E., Webster, M.D., Jacoby, H.D., Prinn, R.G.

### 27 **Climate change: Uncertainty and climate change assessments**

(2001) *Science*, 293 (5529), pp. 430+431+433. [Cited 70 times](#).

[FIND@UOW](#)

### ☐ Sain, S.R., Furrer, R.

### 28 **Combining climate model output via model correlations**

(2010) *Stochastic Environmental Research and Risk Assessment*, 24 (6), pp. 821-829. [Cited 7 times](#).

doi: [10.1007/s00477-010-0380-5](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00477-010-0380-5)

[FIND@UOW](#)

### ☐ Sain, S., Furrer, R., Cressie, N.

### 29 **Combining ensembles of regional climate model output via a multivariate Markov random field model**

(2011) *Ann. Appl. Statist.*, 5, pp. 150-175.



- ☐ Sain, S.R., Nychka, D., Mearns, L.

30 **Functional ANOVA and regional climate experiments: A statistical analysis of dynamic downscaling**

(2011) *Environmetrics*, 22 (6), pp. 700-711. Cited 3 times.

doi: [10.1002/env.1068](https://doi.org/10.1002/env.1068)



- ☐ Schliep, E.M., Cooley, D., Sain, S.R., Hoeting, J.A.

31 **A comparison study of extreme precipitation from six different regional climate models via spatial hierarchical modeling**

(2010) *Extremes*, 13 (2), pp. 219-239. Cited 5 times.

doi: [10.1007/s10687-009-0098-2](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10687-009-0098-2)



- ☐ Schneider, S.H.

32 **What is 'dangerous' climate change?**

(2001) *Nature*, 411 (6833), pp. 17-19. Cited 136 times.

doi: [10.1038/35075167](https://doi.org/10.1038/35075167)



- ☐ Shi, T., Cressie, N.

33 **Global statistical analysis of MISR aerosol data: A massive data product from NASA's Terra satellite**

(2007) *Environmetrics*, 18 (7), pp. 665-680. Cited 11 times.

doi: [10.1002/env.864](https://doi.org/10.1002/env.864)



- ☐ Smith, R.L., Tebaldi, C., Nychka, D., Mearns, L.O.

34 **Bayesian modeling of uncertainty in ensembles of climate models**

(2009) *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 104 (485), pp. 97-116. Cited 42 times.

doi: [10.1198/jasa.2009.0007](https://doi.org/10.1198/jasa.2009.0007)

**FIND@UOW** 

- ☐ Solomon, S., Qin, D., Manning, M., Chen, Z., Marquis, M., Averyt, K., Tignor, M., (...), Miller, H.  
35 (2007) *Climate Change 2007: the Physical Science Basis: Working Group I Contribution to the Fourth Assessment Report of the IPCC*  
(eds). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

**FIND@UOW** 

- ☐ Tebaldi, C., Sansó, B.  
36 **Joint projections of temperature and precipitation change from multiple climate models: A hierarchical Bayesian approach**  
(2009) *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society. Series A: Statistics in Society*, 172 (1), pp. 83-106. [Cited 29 times](#).  
doi: [10.1111/j.1467-985X.2008.00545.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-985X.2008.00545.x)

**FIND@UOW** 

- ☐ Tebaldi, C., Smith, R.L., Nychka, D., Mearns, L.O.  
37 **Quantifying uncertainty in projections of regional climate change: A Bayesian approach to the analysis of multimodel ensembles**  
(2005) *Journal of Climate*, 18 (10), pp. 1524-1540. [Cited 178 times](#).  
doi: [10.1175/JCLI3363.1](https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI3363.1)

**FIND@UOW** 

- ☐ Webster, M.  
38 **Communicating climate change uncertainty to policy-makers and the public: An Editorial Comment**  
(2003) *Climatic Change*, 61 (1-2), pp. 1-8. [Cited 24 times](#).  
doi: [10.1023/A:1026351131038](https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1026351131038)

**FIND@UOW** 

- ☐ Wigley, T.M.L., Raper, S.C.B.

39 **Interpretation of high projections for global-mean warming**

(2001) *Science*, 293 (5529), pp. 451-454. [Cited 254 times](#).

doi: [10.1126/science.1061604](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1061604)



☐ Wikle, C.K., Cressie, N.

40 **A dimension-reduced approach to space-time Kalman filtering**

(1999) *Biometrika*, 86 (4), pp. 815-829. [Cited 130 times](#).



☐ Xue, Y., Vasic, R., Janjic, Z., Mesinger, F., Mitchell, K.E.

41 **Assessment of dynamic downscaling of the Continental U.S. Regional Climate using the Eta/SSiB regional climate model**

(2007) *Journal of Climate*, 20 (16), pp. 4172-4193. [Cited 22 times](#).

doi: [10.1175/JCLI4239.1](https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI4239.1)



☐ Yang, R., Berger, J.

42 **Estimation of a covariance matrix using the reference prior**

(1994) *Ann. Statist.*, 22, pp. 1195-1211. [Cited 95 times](#).



☐ Zhang, J., Craigmile, P.F., Cressie, N.

43 **Loss function approaches to predict a spatial quantile and its exceedance region**

(2008) *Technometrics*, 50 (2), pp. 216-227. [Cited 3 times](#).

doi: [10.1198/004017008000000226](https://doi.org/10.1198/004017008000000226)



☐ Zhao, Y., Staudenmayer, J., Coull, B.A., Wand, M.P.

44 **General design Bayesian generalized linear mixed models**

(2006) *Statistical Science*, 21 (1), pp. 35-51. [Cited 45 times](#).

doi: [10.1214/088342306000000015](https://doi.org/10.1214/088342306000000015)



Kang, E.L.; University of Cincinnati, 839 Old Chemistry Building, PO Box 0025, Cincinnati, OH 45221-0025, United States; email:[kangel@ucmail.uc.edu](mailto:kangel@ucmail.uc.edu)  
© Copyright 2012 Elsevier B.V., All rights reserved.

1 of 1

[Top of page](#)

#### About Scopus

[What is Scopus](#)  
[Content coverage](#)  
[What do users think](#)  
[Latest](#)  
[Tutorials](#)  
[Developers](#)

#### Contact and Support

[Contact and support](#)  
[Live Chat](#)

#### About Elsevier

[About Elsevier](#)  
[About SciVerse](#)  
[About SciVal](#)  
[Terms and Conditions](#)  
[Privacy Policy](#)



Copyright © 2012 [Elsevier B.V.](#) All rights reserved. SciVerse® is a registered trademark of Elsevier Properties S.A., used under license. Scopus® is a registered trademark of Elsevier B.V.